

Comments on the Chair's Text for Negotiation

Chair's Text on Implementation

The following paper has been produced by Stakeholder Forum for Our Common Future, regarding the chair's text for negotiation, as an input to the Fourth Preparatory Committee meeting for the World Summit on Sustainable Development.

General Remarks

Whilst the production of a new and "clean" text is very welcome, the lack of a clear and consistent approach throughout the document is disappointing. The "Agenda for Action" document produced by Stakeholder Forum and the South African non-paper during Prep Com 3, both called for a more clear structure to the Johannesburg document, in order to:

- Highlight how the various means of implementation (finance, technology transfer, education etc) will relate to a specific sector;
- Give greater clarity about how different sections of the agreement will relate to each other;
- Ensure an action-orientated and comprehensive approach to the agreement;
- Improve the interpretation and monitoring of commitments made regarding specific institutions of government groups.

Some may argue that it is now too late to introduce a new structure to the text, however this need not be the case, since much of the material is already present in the text. It would simply require some rearrangement, and insertion of those elements that remain absent. We suggest that this would significantly help in establishing an agreement that can be widely understood and used for making real progress over the next 10 to 15 years.

This paper makes some general and specific suggestions about the text, in particular identifying gaps in its current format. Nevertheless we would like to emphasize our position, as outlined above, on the current structure. Generic elements that could be enhanced throughout the text, include:

- Principles: Rights-based approach
- Targets: Planning ahead
- Financial commitments
- Education and awareness raising
- Participation
- Governance: National strategies, an integrated approach; local and sub-national processes; programmes of action
- Information for Decision-making: Assessment, monitoring and indicators

1. Principles: Rights-based approach

Common principles and values are important tools to clearly outline the motivation behind commitments to take action. Most sections in the text currently give some indication of the aims and purpose of the proceeding action points, but this could be significantly improved by recognising the global call for a more equitable and rights based approach to sustainable development. There should be consistent reference to relevant Social, Cultural and Economic Rights in the text. There are currently references to land, water, food and Intellectual Property Rights. However other rights exist for gender, children, education, health amongst others. Such rights should be made explicit.

2. Targets

Some sections include a target date by which a certain goal or programme should be underway, reviewed or completed. This approach should be applied in the remaining sectors, as this

Towards Earth Summit 2002

will help to act a guideline for countries to develop intermediate targets and schedules for reaching these benchmarks. Where relevant there should be further inclusion of intermediate target dates, to help to break down the process into more manageable stages.

3. Financial and resource commitments

International support is essential to help meet the targets, and needs to be flexibly applied to assist strategy formulation, fulfilment of targets etc. Where possible the financial requirements to meet global targets should be specified to act as a bench-mark for the international community. These estimations are currently not present in the text.

4. Education and awareness-raising

The references to education, networking and awareness-raising are incorporated in certain parts of the text but it is clear that this is a cross cutting theme of sustainable development. Its important role must either be clearly supported in the introduction of the text and/or referred to within the subsections of the document.

5. Participation

Recognition of the need for clear, balanced and equitable participative processes, in decision- making, policy formulation, programme development, and implementation is key. This should avoid the overly simplified adoption of a tripartite approach (government, business and the rest of civil society) but rather take a more nuanced inclusion of stakeholders according to issues being addressed. This approach will help to ensure that more marginalized but affected groups, e.g. women, children, elderly, disabled, indigenous peoples, will be given a part to play and sufficient resources to participate more effectively. Clearer definition of stakeholder roles in different sections of the text will help to give stronger linkage between the "Type I" agreements and the "Type II" partnership-based initiatives.

6. Governance

National Strategies - an integrated approach

There are some references in the text to the development of strategies, such as for water resources management. This should be applied more consistently throughout the document, as every sector requires a strategy outlining the key elements for action such as plans, policies, programmes and monitoring mechanisms that require development. Similarly some reference, possibly in the introduction, should be made regarding the need to take a comprehensive view of how strategies relate to each other, and are incorporated into the context of broad national / local / regional strategies for Sustainable Development, as well as the kinds of bodies, national councils/commission set, that will take a role in linking strategies together. The section on biodiversity (ref. 39) is a good example of how it could be described in other sections.

Whilst Sustainable Development incorporates Environment, Social/Cultural and Economic aspects, the "fourth" pillar of governance or politics should be explicitly identified.

Local and sub-national processes: The importance of the sub-national and local level cannot be over emphasised.

"Because so many of the problems and solutions being addressed by Agenda 21 have their roots in the local activities, the participation and cooperation of local authorities will be a determining factor in fulfilling its objectives. Local Authorities construct, operate and maintain economic, social and environmental infrastructure, oversee planning process, establish local environmental policies. As the level of governance closest to the people, they play a vital role in educating, mobilising and responding to the public to promote sustainable development." Ch. 28, Agenda 21

There must be greater acknowledgement of this significant role, as well as learning from local level experiences feeding up to national, regional and global levels. This should not only be applied consistently throughout the text, but should also be outlined more comprehensively in the introduction.

Programmes of action

Similar to the formulation of strategies, every sector needs to develop a programme of action or action plan detailing how a particular aspect of a strategy is going to implemented. The initiation of such programmes/plans also need to be incorporated consistently in the different elements of the text.

7. Information for decision-making: Assessment, Monitoring and Indicators

Towards Earth Summit 2002

All issues require a degree of monitoring and assessment to ensure that progress is being made, help identify the possible barriers to progress, and make recommendations for improvement. Reference to these areas should be adopted more consistently.

Indicators, for monitoring and assessment, are specific to what is being measured, the different issues, information available, and other factors. However, the importance of their development and effective use should be recognised when reference is made to the need for assessment and monitoring of progress.

Towards Earth Summit 2002

Comments on Specific Sections

This section, excepting the comments on the introduction, provides bullet-points of the key gaps and identifies some factors that could be included in each section, according to the following elements:

- Principles
- Targets
- Finance
- Technology transfer, capacity building
- Education and awareness raising
- Participation
- Environment
- Society/Culture
- Economics
- Governance
- Information for Decision-making

I. Introduction

Plan of implementation (ref. 2): Line 9. This paragraph needs to include reference to “promoting social and environmental protection.”

Partnerships (ref 3.): Regarding partnerships and participation of stakeholders, there should be reference at the end of the paragraph as follows: “we will give further support towards empowering people to participate in partnerships programmes and processes. Particular emphasis will be placed on support for more marginalized groups, such as organisations from developing countries, women, children, elderly, indigenous people, poor rural and urban communities.”

Governance (ref 4.): At the end of the paragraph there should be the following line: “We commit to further link sectoral strategies, e.g. poverty, water, land, habitat strategies, to National Strategies for Sustainable Development”

Peace, security and stability (ref 5.): This paragraph talks about a very significant issue which impacts upon all aspects of sustainable development. However, aside from this brief section it is not discussed consistently throughout the document. Further effort should be made to highlight this area throughout the document, in particular under sections on globalisation and health. Paragraph 5. should state “we will work to further build a culture of peace. We further determine to re-target [25%] of current levels of military investment and expenditure toward sustainable development priorities”

A larger section on peace and security would include reference to the agreements:

“Recognising the Declaration on the Right of Peoples to Peace, the Declaration on the Protection of Women and Children in Emergency and Armed Conflict, the Declaration on the Use of Scientific and Technological Progress in the Interests of Peace and for the Benefit of Mankind and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict.”

“Supporting the commitments of the Millennium Declaration (MD) in this area, in particular: Article II on Peace, security and disarmament, Article IV (23) on the role of media in communicating peace and Article VII (28) on conflict prevention and resources for peace keeping”

Add in a new section:

Means of Implementation: To achieve and implement these overall objectives and the following specific commitments, the means of implementation, including: increasing financial resources; improving trade opportunities; transfer of environmentally sound technologies; education and awareness raising; capacity building; information for decision making and scientific capacities, are cross-cutting elements which apply to all other issues addressed in this agreement.”

II. Poverty Eradication

Poverty, Hunger, Drinking water Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Sanitation target (ref. 6. – 8.)

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to development, the Right to adequate food, water rights, Right to the highest [attainable standard of health](#), and the Right to education”
- Target: No intermediate target dates to 2015 benchmarks. No reference to education 2015 goals
- Finance: No global financial estimate for World Solidarity Fund or for meeting the hunger, drinking water, sanitation and education MDGs
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to either
- Education and awareness raising: No reference to need for education regarding specific areas (poverty, hunger, drinking water, sanitation),
- Participation: Groups, such as elderly, workers and trade unions, local authorities, faith communities should be included. There is no reference for the need to involve stakeholders right from the formulation of a Poverty Reduction Strategy
- Environment: No reference to Integrated Water Resource Management Approach
- Society/Culture: No reference to social and cultural aspects regarding access to drinking water, in particular “developing strategies for equitable access to water for all people” (Bonn)
- Economics: Adoption of a Public-Private-Partnerships approach should be openly decided by national and local stakeholders
- Governance: No reference to National Strategies for Sustainable Development (NSSDs) specific strategies, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Energy (ref. 9.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to development”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate to meet goals
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference, particularly to marginalised groups (women, children, rural communities, elderly, indigenous peoples)
- Environment: No reference to integrated management approach
- Governance: No reference of relationship to NSSDs or the local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Industrial development (ref 10.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to development”, precautionary principle, polluter pays principle
- Targets: No target date
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference to marginalized groups (women, children, elderly, indigenous peoples)
- Environment: No reference to sustainable production and consumption
- Governance: No reference to strategies, programmes of action, international cooperation, local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Habitat (ref. 11.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to [adequate housing](#)”
- Targets: No intermediate targets dates for 2020 benchmark
- Finance: No global financial estimate for meeting MDG
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference to other marginalized groups (children, rural communities, elderly, indigenous peoples)
- Environment: No reference to integrated management approach
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, specific strategies, programmes of action, international cooperation or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

III. Changing Unsustainable Patterns of Consumption and Production

General (ref. 12-13.)

- Principles: No reference to “**supporting the precautionary principle, and ILO labour standards**”
- Targets: No reference to environment MDG, or start date of work programme
- Finance: No global financial estimate for work programme or meeting MDG
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Participation: Avoid separation of one major groups, i.e. private sector, from other major groups or identify all the other major groups to ensure (see 12. line 5)
- Governance: No reference of work programme's relationship to NSSDs, international cooperation

Clean Production and Eco-efficiency (ref. 14.)

- Targets: No reference to a target date
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference to marginalised groups
- Governance: No reference to NSSD, international cooperation or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Corporate Environmental and Social Responsibility and Accountability (ref. 15.)

- Principles: No reference to ILO labour standards
- Targets: No target date
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to technology transfer
- Participation: No reference to trade unions and workers, local authorities, indigenous people, women, children
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, specific strategies, programmes of action, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation or local level

Training Authorities (ref. 16.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the subsidiarity, common and differentiated responsibilities, participation, integrated decision making principles”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference to other stakeholders
- Society/Culture: No references e.g. social safety nets for subsidy removal
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, specific strategies, programmes of action, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Energy for Sustainable Development (ref. 17.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the polluter pays and integrated decision-making principles”.
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Participation: No reference to other marginalized groups, in particular children, rural communities, elderly, indigenous peoples
- Environment: No reference to integrated approach
- Society/Culture: No reference to equitable access to energy
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, specific strategies, programmes of action, regulatory frameworks, or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Transport services and systems (ref 18.)

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the polluter pays principle or common and differentiated responsibilities”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference
- Environment: No reference to integrated management
- Economics: No reference of importance of transport to economic development
- Governance: No reference of relationship to NSSDs, no programme of action, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Waste Re-use and Recycling (ref. 19.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the polluter pays and integrated decision-making principles”.
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Environment: No reference to integrated management
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, no programme of action, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation or local level, in particular supporting “Decentralisation of water management and localized capacity building initiatives are key” (Bonn)
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Chemical Management (ref. 20.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the polluter pays and integrated decision-making principles”.
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference to education
- Participation: Reference to partnerships but no definition of stakeholders
- Economics: No reference of economic cost of mis-management or incentive based approach to good management
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, no programme of action, international cooperation or local level

IV. Protecting and managing the natural resource base of economic and social development

Ecosystems Integrity (ref. 21.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles” Targets: No reference to Environment MDG
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, no programme of action, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Drinking water, Integrated Water Resources Management (ref. 22-26.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Target: No intermediate targets for MDG
- Finance: No global financial estimate

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Education and awareness raising: No reference to education
- Economics: Adoption of a Public-Private-Partnerships approach should be openly decided, before implementation, by national and local stakeholders
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, no programme of action, regulatory frameworks, international cooperation or local level

Oceans, seas and coastal areas, fish stocks, marine living resources, Global programme of action (GPA), scientific understanding of marine and coastal systems (ref 27-31.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No target date for oceans management, GPA, science
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference to marginalised groups, in particular coastal communities, women, children, elderly, disabled people, subsistence fishing community
- Society/Culture: No reference to social consequences of changes in fishing sector
- Economics: No reference in oceans management
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sector strategy, or reference to local level
- Information for decision-making: The role the oceans play in climate change dynamics e.g. el nino, needs to be further researched and understood

Disasters (ref 31.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate for global trust fund
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference, except under early warning systems
- Society/Culture: No reference
- Economics: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, or local level
- Information for decision-making: No reference to indicators, need to better understand ecosystem function in reducing risk of disasters

Climate Change and Air Pollution (ref 33-34.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Finance: No global financial estimate for Climate Change or air pollution
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference
- Environment: No reference to global assessment of broader (outside Artic/Antartic) environmental impact of climate change
- Society/Culture: No reference to global assessment of broader (outside Artic/Antartic) social impact of climate change
- Economics: No reference to global assessment of broader (outside Artic/Antartic) economic impact of climate change
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, no programme of action, or reference to international cooperation or local level
- Information for decision-making: No reference to indicators. Need to further assess the links between climate change and earth, land and atmospheric interactions, not just in Artic and Antartic.

Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Development (SARD) (ref. 35.)

- Principles: No reference to “recognising the Universal Declaration on the Eradication of Hunger and Malnutrition, the outcomes of the 2002 World Food Summit, and supporting integrated decision-making, common and

Towards Earth Summit 2002

differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”

- Targets: No intermediate target dates
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to technology transfer
- Education and awareness raising: No reference to education
- Society/culture: No reference to “introducing social safety nets if undertaking subsidy removal”
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs
- Information for decision-making: No reference to indicators

Desertification (ref. 36.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference
- Economics: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs or sectoral strategies
- Information for decision-making: No reference to indicators

Mountains (ref. 37.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to technology transfer
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs or sectoral strategies, regulatory frameworks or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Sustainable Tourism (ref. 38.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Education and awareness raising: No reference to education
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs or sectoral strategies
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Biodiversity (ref. 39.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No intermediate target dates
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Governance: No reference to the local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Forests (ref. 40.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Education and awareness raising: No reference

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Governance: No reference to NSSDs or sectoral strategies, programme of action, or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

Mining, Minerals and Metals (ref. 41.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting integrated decision-making, common and differentiated responsibility, polluter pays and precautionary principles”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Education and awareness raising: No reference to education
- Participation: No reference to other groups, in particular women, children, workers and trade unions, local authorities
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs or sectoral strategies, programme of action, regulatory frameworks or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

V. Sustainable Development in a Globalising World (ref. 42)

Note: This section seems to be out of place. The references to trade in “Means of Implementation” should either be moved to this section or this should be moved to the trade section.

- Principles: No reference to “recognising Human rights as the primary objective of international trade, investment and finance policy and practice and supporting the Rio principles, ILO standards and Human Rights”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Environment: No reference to Integrated Management
- Economics: Adoption of a Public-Private-Partnerships approach should be openly decided, before implementation, by national and local stakeholders
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs or sectoral strategies, programme of action, regulatory frameworks or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

VI. Health and Sustainable Development

Basic health care services (ref. 43-44.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to the highest [attainable standard of health](#) and precautionary principle”
- Targets: No intermediate target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Economics: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, regulatory frameworks, international and regional coordination, or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of progress or indicators

HIV/AIDS (ref. 45. & 47.)

Recommend moving point 47. to proceed 45.

- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: no reference to business, local authorities, indigenous people, women, elderly people
- Environment: No reference (biodiversity potential)
- Economics: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, regulatory frameworks, or local level

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Information for Decision-making: No reference

Respiratory diseases and diseases from air pollution (ref. 46.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the polluter pays principle”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference to other groups, in particular, local authorities, workers and trade unions, elderly, disabled, indigenous people, rural / urban communities
- Environment: No reference to integrated management
- Economics: Adoption of a Public-Private-Partnerships approach should be openly decided, before implementation, by national and local stakeholders
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sectoral strategies, international coordination, or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review work or indicators

VII Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States (ref. 48-50.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to development and principle of common and differentiated responsibility”
- Finance: No global financial estimates for coastal, energy, tourism, trade targets
- Education and awareness raising: no reference
- Participation: No reference to women, children, elderly, disabled, workers, local authorities, business
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sectoral strategies, international and regional coordination

VIII. Sustainable Development initiatives for Africa (ref. 51-58.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the Right to development and principle of common and differentiated responsibility”
- Targets: No target dates for Habitat, tourism, chemicals, natural disasters and conflicts, NEPAD. No intermediate target dates for food security and digital divide
- Finance: No global financial estimates for dealing with water, food, digital divide, chemicals, natural disasters and conflicts, habitat, tourism and NEPAD
- Participation: No breakdown of “relevant stakeholders”, no reference for the need to involve stakeholders right from the formulation of a Poverty Reduction Strategy
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sectoral strategies (except water and chemicals), programmes of action, regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

IX. Means of implementation

General and ODA (ref. 59-61.).

- Targets: No target dates
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to technology transfer
- Education and awareness raising: No reference regarding ODA
- Participation: No reference
- Environment: No reference to integrated resource management approach
- Society/Culture: No reference to building sustainable livelihoods
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sectoral strategies, regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Mobilising Domestic Resources (ref. 62- 64.)

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Targets: No target dates
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Environment: No reference to the establishment of National Environment Funds
- Society/Culture: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sectoral strategies, regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international or regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

Debt (ref. 65.)

- Principles: No reference to “supporting the principle of common and differentiated responsibilities”
- Targets: No target date
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Environment: No reference relating to action
- Society/Culture: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, sectoral strategies, regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international or regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of progress or indicators

Trade/Doha (ref. 66-70).

- Principles: No reference to “recognising human rights as the primary objective of international trade, investment and finance policy and practice”.
- Targets: No target dates
- Finance: No global financial estimate for trust funds
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to capacity building
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Participation: No reference
- Environment: Include assessment of the environmental impacts of trade
- Society/Culture: Include assessment of the social/cultural impacts of trade. No reference to “introducing social safety nets if undertaking subsidy removal”
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international or regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

Technology transfer, capacity building (ref. 71-80. and 89-90.)

Recommendation that sections 89. and 90. be moved to the capacity building section

- Principles: No reference to “recognising intellectual property rights and human rights and supporting the precautionary and subsidiarity principles”
- Targets: No target date for capacity building
- Finance: No global financial estimate
- Economics: Adoption of a Public-Private-Partnerships approach should be openly decided, before implementation, by national and local stakeholders
- Governance: No reference to regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international or regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to review of work or indicators

Education (ref. 81– 88.)

- Principles: No reference to “recognising the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms”
- Targets: No intermediate target dates for primary education goal

Towards Earth Summit 2002

- Finance: No global financial estimate for primary, secondary, research, gender goals
- Environment: No reference
- Society/Culture: No reference
- Economics: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international or regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to indicators

Information for decision-making (ref. 91–100.)

- Targets: No target dates
- Finance: No reference
- Technology transfer, capacity building: No reference to technology transfer
- Education and awareness raising: No reference
- Society/Culture: No reference
- Economics: No reference
- Governance: No reference to NSSDs, regulatory frameworks, programmes of action, international or regional coordination or local level
- Information for Decision-making: No reference to use of SMART (specific, measurable, accurate, reliable, time bound) indicators. No reference to review of work.

References

Commission on Human Rights (1974) *Declaration on the Protection of Women and Children in Emergency and Armed Conflict*. Proclaimed by General Assembly resolution 3318(XXIX) of 14 December 1974 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/24.htm>

(1974) *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* Adopted by the General Conference of UNESCO at its 18th session on 19 November 1974 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/77.htm>

(1974) *Universal Declaration on the Eradication of Hunger and Malnutrition* Adopted on 16 November 1974 by the World Food Conference convened under General Assembly resolution 3180 (XXVIII) of 17 December 1973; and endorsed by General Assembly resolution 3348 (XXIX) of 17 December 1974 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/69.htm>

(1975) *Declaration on the Use of Scientific and Technological Progress in the Interests of Peace and for the Benefit of Mankind* Proclaimed by General Assembly resolution 3384 (XXX) of 10 November 1975 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/70.htm>

(1984) *Declaration on the Right of Peoples to Peace*. Approved by General Assembly resolution 39/11 of 12 November 1984 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/73.htm>

(1986) *Declaration on the Right to Development*. Adopted by General Assembly resolution 41/128 of 4 December 1986 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/74.htm>

(1999) *Human rights as the primary objective of international trade, investment and finance policy and practice*. Working paper by J. Oloka-Onyango and Deepika Udagama, in accordance with Sub-Commission resolution 1998/12 (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1999/11). Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities Fifty-first session Item 4 of the provisional agenda. THE REALIZATION OF ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS. [http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/\(Symbol\)/E.CN.4.Sub.2.1999.11.En?Opendocument](http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(Symbol)/E.CN.4.Sub.2.1999.11.En?Opendocument)

(2000) *Rights of the child*. Resolution 2000/85, [http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/\(Symbol\)/E.CN.4.RES.2000.85.En?Opendocument](http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(Symbol)/E.CN.4.RES.2000.85.En?Opendocument)

(2000 a.) *Intellectual property rights and human rights*. Sub-Commission on Human Rights Resolution 2000/7 August 2000, [http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/\(Symbol\)/E.CN.4.Sub.2.RES.2000.7.En?Opendocument](http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(Symbol)/E.CN.4.Sub.2.RES.2000.7.En?Opendocument)

(2001) *The impact of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights on human rights*. The High Commissioner's report to the 53 rd session of the Sub-Commission ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS. Report of the High Commissioner (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2001/13) [http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/\(Symbol\)/E.CN.4.Sub.2.2001.13.En?Opendocument](http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(Symbol)/E.CN.4.Sub.2.2001.13.En?Opendocument)

(2001) *Poverty and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights* 10/05/2001. E/C.12/2001/10. (Other Treaty-Related Document). Twenty-fifth session Geneva, 23 April-11 May 2001 Agenda item 5 <http://www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/0ac7e03e4fe8f2bdc125698a0053bf66/518e88bfb89822c9c1256a4e004df048?OpenDocument>

(2002) *Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict* General Assembly resolution A/RES/54/263 of 25 May 2000. Entered into force on 12 February 2002 <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu2/6/protocolchild.htm>

(2002) Working group on a draft *declaration on the rights of indigenous peoples* http://www.unhchr.ch/indigenous/ind_sub.htm#chrwg

Towards Earth Summit 2002

International Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1991) *The right to adequate housing* (Article 11 (1)) General Comment 4 - under HUMAN SETTLEMENTS SECTION PLAN OF ACTION INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS <http://www.cesr.org/ESCR/gencomment4.htm>

(1999) *Plans of action for primary education* (Article 14) General Comment 11. SUBSTANTIVE ISSUES ARISING IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS. COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS. Twentieth session, Geneva, 26 April-14 May 1999 E/C.12/1999/4, CESCR <http://www.cesr.org/ESCR/gencomment11.htm>

(1999) *The right to adequate food* (CESCR Article 11) General comment 12 - SUBSTANTIVE ISSUES ARISING IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS. Twentieth session, Geneva, 26 April-14 May 1999 E/C.12/1999/5, CESCR <http://www.cesr.org/ESCR/gencomment12.htm>

(1999) *The right to education*. General Comment 13 (Article 13) SUBSTANTIVE ISSUES ARISING IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS. Twenty-first session, Geneva, 15 November-3 December 1999 E/C.12/1999/10, CESCR <http://www.cesr.org/ESCR/gencomment13.htm>

(2000) *The right to the highest attainable standard of health*: 11/08/2000. E/C.12/2000/4, CESCR General Comment 14. COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS Twenty-second session Geneva, 25 April-12 May 2000 Agenda item 3 <http://www.cesr.org/ESCR/gencomment14.htm>

United Nations General Assembly (1962) General Assembly resolution 1803 (XVII) of 14 December 1962, "*Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources*" Adopted by General Assembly resolution 1803 (XVII) of 14 December 1962 http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/c_natres.htm

(1991) *Global Strategy for Shelter*. Adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 46/163, 78th plenary meeting, 19 December 1991. Global Strategy for Shelter to the Year 2000. <http://www.un.org/documents/ga/res/46/a46r163.htm>

UN Commission on Sustainable Development (ongoing) Indicators of Sustainable development <http://www.un.org/esa/sustdev/isd.htm>

UN Conference on Environment and Development (1992) Agenda 21 <http://www.un.org/esa/sustdev/agenda21text.htm>

(1992) The Rio Declaration on Environment and Development REPORT OF THE UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCE ON ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT (Rio de Janeiro, 3-14 June 1992) Annex A/CONF.151/26 (Vol. I) <http://www.un.org/documents/ga/conf151/aconf15126-1annex1.htm>

UN Millennium Summit (2000) Millennium Declaration Resolution adopted by the General Assembly [without reference to a Main Committee (A/55/L.2)]55/2. <http://www.un.org/millennium/summit.htm>



This paper was produced as part of the *Towards Earth Summit 2002* project.
Rosalee Gardiner, International Policy Coordinator, Stakeholder Forum for Our Common Future
c/o UNA, 3 Whitehall Court London SW1A 2EL UK.
May 2002

Tel: +44 (0) 20 7839 7171 / Fax: +44 (0) 20 7930 5893
E-mail: rgardiner@earthsummit2002.org
Web: www.earthsummit2002.org